

HAMBLETON DISTRICT COUNCIL

**Report To: Cabinet
20 March 2012**

Subject: CAPITAL PROGRAMME SCHEMES

**All Wards
Scrutiny Committees
Cabinet Member for Partnerships: Councillor Tim Swales
Cabinet Member for Corporate Management: Councillor Ron Kirk
Cabinet Member for Leisure and Health: Councillor Peter Wilkinson**

1.0 PURPOSE AND BACKGROUND:

1.1 The purpose of the report is to seek authority from Cabinet to implement the following schemes which are all included within the Council's approved ten year capital programme, except for the Springboard car park extension.

A- Adoption Works at Thurston Road, Northallerton Business Park	£130,000
B- Pool Tank Grouting repairs at Hambleton, Thirsk & Bedale Leisure Centres	£120,000
C- Adoption Works at Ellerbeck Court, Stokesley Industrial Park	£ 49,000
D- Gas Boilers Replacement at Civic Centre , Northallerton	£ 42,000
E- Hambleton District Public Lighting Replacements	£ 36,000
F- Installing Voltage Optimisers at Stokesley & Bedale Leisure Centres	£ 24,000
G- Additional Parking, Springboard Business Centre, Stokesley Business Park	£ 20,000
H- Roof repairs at Hambleton Leisure Centre	£ 15,000
I- Pipework Insulation, Stokesley, Thirsk & Bedale Leisure Centres	£ 7,000
J- Purchase of Bins and Boxes for Refuse and Recycling	£ 36,000

1.2 Value for Money Forms are attached at Annex A to J which outline specific justifications for each scheme.

2.0 DECISIONS SOUGHT:

2.1 Cabinet is asked to authorised expenditure on the capital schemes outlined in paragraph 1.1, schemes A to J.

3.0 LINK TO CORPORATE PRIORITIES:

3.1 This report links to the efficient use of Council resources and demonstrates value for money in the implementation of the individual schemes.

4.0 RISK ASSESSMENT:

4.1 No significant risks associated with this project. Refer to information contained in each annex for risks associated with not undertaking each scheme.

5.0 SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

5.1 There will be a combined reduction in energy costs reaching a total saving of £10,000 per annum following the implementation of the Civic Centre gas boilers replacement , leisure centres voltage optimisers and pipework insulation (schemes D, F and I).

6.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS AND EFFICIENCIES:

6.1 a) Capital costs

Capital Expenditure	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15
	£	£	£	£
Thurston Rd Adoption Works,	-	130,000	-	-
Leisure Centres Pool Tile Repairs	-	120,000	-	-
Ellerbeek Ct Adoption Works,	-	49,000	-	-
Civic Centre Gas Boiler	-	42,000	-	-
Public Lighting Replacements	36,000	36,000	-	-
Leisure Centre Voltage Optimisers at Stokesley & Bedale	-	24,000	-	-
Springboard Car Park Extension	-	20,000	-	-
Hambleton Leisure Centre Roof Repairs	-	15,000	-	-
Leisure Centres Pipework Insulation	7,000	-	-	-
Purchase of Bins and Boxes for Refuse and Recycling	36,000	36,000	-	-
Total Capital Cost	79,000	472,000	-	-
Financed by:				
Capital Programme:	79,000	472,000	-	-

b) Following the installation of the voltage optimisers at Stokesley and Bedale Leisure Centres; the replacement of the Civic Centre gas boiler and pipework installations at the leisure centres there will be immediate saving on the Council's energy costs.

Revenue Effects	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15
	£	£	£	£
Electricity energy savings voltage optimisers	-	3,800	4,500	4,500
Gas savings - pipeworks insulation works	-	4,500	4,500	4,500
Gas savings – Civic Centre boiler		500	1,000	1,000
Total Energy Savings	0	8,800	10,000	10,000

6.2 All the schemes are within the current approved 10 year Capital Programme, except for the Springboard Car Park extension. If Members are minded to approve the scheme, funding will be identified from savings within the current overall Capital Programme Fund.

7.0 LEGAL IMPLICATIONS:

7.1 On satisfactory completion of the adoption works at Thurston Road, Northallerton and Ellerbeck Court, Stokesley the highway and associated infrastructure will be formally adopted by North Yorkshire County Council and Yorkshire Waters Services and will subsequently cease to be the responsibility of the District Council (schemes A and C).

7.2 Works undertaken on repairs to the pool tilling grout will reduce the risk of substantiated injury insurance claims which have been recently lodged on the Council (scheme B).

8.0 SECTION 17 CRIME AND DISORDER ACT 1998:

8.1 None.

9.0 EQUALITY/DIVERSITY ISSUES:

9.1 None.

10.0 RECOMMENDATION:

10.1 It is recommended the schemes detailed in paragraph 1.1 and included in the attached Annexes A to J be approved for implementation.

PHIL MORTON

Background papers: None

Author ref: DJMcG

Contact: David McGloin
Direct Line: 01609 767044

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Adoption Works at
Thurston Road, Northallerton Business Park

Evidence of Need

The proposal to bring Thurston Road at Northallerton Business Park highway and sewerage infrastructure up to a standard to enable adoption by North Yorkshire County Council and Yorkshire Water Services represents good value for money.

The allocation of £130,000 of capital expenditure on this scheme to achieve adoption of the highway and sewerage infrastructure will remove the District Council's financial liability for maintenance and other responsibilities associated with ownership.

Whilst the District Council retains ownership of the highway and sewerage infrastructure it will be responsible for its day-to-day maintenance including revenue and capital expenditure and officer time in managing the infrastructure. If the District Council does not approve the scheme, and hence retains responsibility, in the medium and long term there will be natural deterioration of the highway and sewerage infrastructure which will require increasing revenue expenditure and eventual capital expenditure, which will exceed the current capital expenditure allocation.

COSTS:**Capital**

	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£	£	£	£
Sewerage works	69,000	-	-	-
Highway works	61,000	-	-	-
Total Capital Works	130,000	0	0	0
<hr/>				
Financed by :				
Capital Programme	130,000	-	-	-
	130,000	0	0	0

Efficiency Gains

The present revenue expenditure is relatively low, however as the infrastructure deteriorates there will be a requirement for an increasing allocation of revenue and capital expenditure to undertake maintenance repairs. On adoption of the sewerage and highway infrastructure liability for revenue and potential capital expenditure will be removed.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

On adoption of the sewerage infrastructure by Yorkshire Water Services Limited and the highway infrastructure by North Yorkshire County Council, the highway and sewerage infrastructure on the Northallerton Business Park will have the status of public highway and public sewerage respectively. The customer (highway and sewerage user) will benefit from the infrastructure being owned, maintained and enforced by the appropriate statutory bodies including potential improved parking enforcement along Thurston Road. This is currently a significant issue for the businesses on the business park.

There is a current issue on the Business Park relating to the parking of business employee and visitor vehicles on the highway causing access difficulties. As Thurston Road is a private road, enforcement cannot be undertaken by North Yorkshire Police and North Yorkshire County Council

cannot introduce traffic management measures, with pressure being exerted on the District Council as the current highway owner. Adoption of the highway will allow both NYCC and NY Police to manage traffic on the highway.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

- Hambleton District Council retains ownership of the Northallerton Business Park highway and sewerage infrastructure.

The District Council will retain responsibility for the highway and sewerage infrastructure; it will have an on-going financial liability for the maintenance on a revenue and capital basis in the short, medium and long term. As the infrastructure naturally deteriorates the capital expenditure proposed under this scheme and on a repeating cyclical basis will have to be expended at some stage to maintain the highway in safe condition and the sewerage infrastructure in operationally functioning condition.

The District Council will continue to owe a duty to highway users to maintain the surface in a safe condition and to manage the traffic issues; if we fail to maintain the surface in safe condition then we will become liable for any accidents that occur through negligence.

The District Council will have to maintain the sewerage infrastructure in operational condition or it will be liable for incidents relating to failure of the sewerage infrastructure.

- Highway and Sewerage infrastructure brought up to adoptable standard by Hambleton District Council.

- In-house management of works. The Design and Maintenance section has achieved adoption of highway infrastructure in the recent past. Current officer resource levels in the section combined with the wide portfolio of work the section currently undertakes, allied with the nature of the adoption process and the requirement for intense officer involvement during the adoption process mean that the work is not best suited to be undertaken by the Design and Maintenance Section at this time.

- Management by a specialist adoption company. The proposal is to use JLES a company specialising in infrastructure adoption. They have a track record of delivery and are experienced in achieving infrastructure adoption. They are able to provide the dedicated intense staff resource involvement at the times that it is needed and have good relations with the adopting authorities. The risk controlled contract agreement between the District Council and JLES will ensure that payment is linked to the achievement of agreed milestone adoption outcomes. The Design and Maintenance section will manage JLES.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

Risk	Implication	Prob*	Imp*	Total	Preventative action
Deterioration of the highway and sewerage infrastructure into unsafe or non-functioning condition due to inappropriate level of revenue and capital expenditure.	Asset condition will deteriorate and claims may ensue from users coupled with associated reputation consequences	5	3	15	Allocate appropriate level of revenue and capital expenditure to maintain asset condition. This will be required on a repeating cyclical basis whilst HDC retains ownership of the infrastructure.

Prob = Probability, Imp = Impact, Score range is Low = 1, High = 5

- The condition of the Northallerton Business Park highway and sewerage infrastructure will naturally deteriorate with age; this will require an increasing level of revenue expenditure to maintain it in operationally functioning condition and in safe condition for users in the short and medium term. In the long term (5 to 10 years and every 20 years thereafter on average) and on the repeating cyclical basis, capital expenditure over and above the proposed capital allocation sought under this scheme will be required to maintain the highway and sewerage infrastructure.
- If an appropriate level of revenue and capital expenditure is not made available the sewerage infrastructure will fail and the highway infrastructure will deteriorate to a condition where it will become unsafe, the District Council as owner owes a duty of care to users and may be liable for injury or loss.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- **CO² Emissions**
At present the main emissions from the business park emanate from the highway lighting system and the pumps in the foul water pumping station. There are no immediate plans to reduce these emissions. However once the works are fully adopted there may be initiatives undertaken by NYCC and YWS to increase efficiencies and management issues related to effecting carbon reductions.
- **Whole Life Costing**
Capital expenditure during 2012/13 will remove liability for future maintenance and capital expenditure on the highway and sewerage infrastructure.
- **Social Effects**
Management of infrastructure by appropriate organisations including traffic management.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

- The Northallerton Business Park was constructed by Hambleton District Council to provide industrial development land. The sewerage infrastructure includes, foul and surface water sewerage and a foul pumping station. The highway infrastructure includes roads, footpaths and lighting.
- Adoption of highway and sewerage infrastructure by North Yorkshire County Council (the Highway Authority) and Yorkshire Water Services (regional Water and Sewerage Company) will support the District Council strategic intent when entering into adoption agreements.
- The Business Park Forum are in support of the adoption of the infrastructure.

CONCLUSIONS:

The proposal to bring Thurston Road at the Northallerton Business Park highway and sewerage infrastructure up to a standard to enable adoption by North Yorkshire County Council (NYCC) and Yorkshire Water Services (YWS) represents good value for money.

By approving the £130,000 capital expenditure will achieve transfer of the highway and sewerage infrastructure removing all associated District Council liabilities.

If the District Council do not approve the scheme and so retain ownership of the highway and sewerage infrastructure in perpetuity then the natural deterioration of the highway and sewerage infrastructure will eventually require cumulative maintenance and capital allocations in excess of the amount of capital expenditure proposed under this scheme.

<p>Version Number : 2 Date last changed : 13 February 2012 Lead Officer : C Thornton / C Vincent</p>

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Pool Tank Grouting Repairs
Hambleton, Thirsk and Bedale Leisure Centres

Evidence of Need

This is a statement regarding the necessary works in rectifying deteriorating submerged tiling to the pools at Hambleton, Thirsk and Bedale Leisure Centres.

Since an assessment undertaken in 2008 the pool tiles at the three leisure centre have shown a continued decline with corrosion of the tile grouting between the tiles also causing potential compromise to the surface bonding of the tiles and resulting in areas of increased risk of tile loss and exposed tile edges causing cuts to pool users. The affected areas are now considered to require urgent repair.

Incidents have occurred at the pools resulting in substantiated insurance claims from customers.

In order to reduce the risk of further damage to the tile surfaces and maintain the availability of the pool facility through the normal daytime hours proposals are recommended for the works to be undertaken during the night by divers. By endeavouring to maintain a balanced water pressure against the pool surface this will reduce the risk of completed tiling bond failure in the event of the pool being emptied and subsequently not requiring any period of closure of the pool to the public.

The costs to carry out these works outside hours are: Hambleton Leisure Centre £55,000, Thirsk Leisure Centre £37,000 and BLC £28,000 these accord with the allocation of £120,000 for this financial year within the Council's ten year programme.

COSTS:**Capital**

	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£	£	£	£
Hambleton LC tile repairs	55,000	-	-	-
Thirsk LC tile repairs	37,000			
Bedale LC tile repairs	28,000			
Total Capital Works	120,000	0	0	0
Financed by :				
Capital Programme	120,000	-	-	-
	120,000	0	0	0

Efficiency Gains

Undertaking the works will reduce the risks of further claims from pool users in respect of injuries from the exposed tile edges as a consequence of grouting degradation.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

As works will be undertaken out-of hours they will present no significant changes to the leisure centre undertakings and thus result in no adverse effects on users of the facilities.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

The two main options for undertaking the works include out-of-hours works undertaken by divers or draining down the pool water and working directly on the pool surfaces. The latter option will increase the risk of pool tile adhesion failures due to differential pressure being introduced by draining the water. Plus increased cost in requirement to the refill the pool and also reheat the pool water. There would also be commensurate loss of income revenue for the duration of the pool closure, estimated at two weeks, needed to undertake the works. Thus for all these reasons the method of repair in utilising divers is deemed to be the best option.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

In not undertaking the works there will be further deterioration of the grouting and potential further claims from pool users from injuries caused by the exposed edges of the pool tiles. Also there is increased risk of tile de-lamination if there are prolonged delays in undertaking the works

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- **CO² Emissions**
As there will be no requirement to drain down the pool water levels to undertake the works there will be no consequential energy losses as there will be no need to reheat and chemically treat any top-up waters
- **Whole Life Costing**
The proposed new two-pack replacement tile grouting method is anticipated to remain fit for purpose for a period of at least 10 years.
- **Social Effects**
Should the repairs not be undertaken or significantly delayed this could result in the facility facing potential limited closure due to the extended extent of works required. The works will also result in increased customer satisfaction and reduced the risk of further injury claims from pool users.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

No impacts to partnerships are anticipated subject to works being undertaken promptly.

The Leisure pools are a shared facility with North Yorkshire County Council with school in the vicinity. There would be implications on school timetables and other agencies who utilise the centre should more extensive repairs be needed in the potential event of extended delays.

CONCLUSIONS:

Given the extent and condition of the grouting to the pool tiles it is recommended that out-of-hours repairs are undertaken promptly by underwater application by divers at:-

- * Hambleton Leisure Centre pool at an anticipated cost of £55,000
- * Thirsk & Sowerby Leisure Centre pool at an anticipated cost of £37,000
- * Bedale Leisure Centre pool at an anticipated cost of £28,000

Thus the combined repair costs of the pool tile repairs will be approximately £120,000

<p>Version Number : 3 Date last changed : 9 February 2012 Lead Officer : S Prentice / C Vincent</p>

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Adoption Works at
Ellerbeck Court, Stokesley Business Park (Phases 2B & 3)

Evidence of Need

The proposal to bring Ellerbeck Court highway at Stokesley Business Park (Phases 2B& 3) up to a standard to enable adoption by North Yorkshire County Council represents good value for money.

The allocation of £49,000 of capital expenditure on this scheme to achieve adoption of the highway infrastructure will remove the District Council's financial liability for maintenance and other responsibilities associated with ownership.

Whilst the District Council retains ownership of the highway infrastructure it will be responsible for its day-to-day maintenance including revenue and capital expenditure and Officer Time managing the infrastructure. If the District Council does not approve the scheme, and hence retains responsibility, in the medium and long term there will be natural deterioration of the highway infrastructure which will require increasing revenue expenditure and eventual capital expenditure, which will cumulatively eventually exceed the proposed capital expenditure allocation.

COSTS:**Capital**

	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£	£	£	£
Highway works	49,000	-	-	-
Total Capital Works	49,000	0	0	0
Financed by :				
Capital Programme	49,000	-	-	-
	49,000	0	0	0

Efficiency Gains

The present revenue expenditure on the highway infrastructure is relatively low. In the medium and long term as the infrastructure deteriorates there will be a requirement for an increasing allocation of revenue expenditure and capital expenditure to undertake maintenance repairs. On adoption of the highway infrastructure, liability for revenue and potential capital expenditure allocations and related Officer involvement will be removed.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

On adoption of the highway infrastructure by the Highway Authority - North Yorkshire County Council, the highway infrastructure on the Stokesley Business Park will have the status of public highway. The customer (highway user) will benefit from the infrastructure being owned, maintained and enforced by the appropriate statutory body (i.e. NYCC and North Yorkshire Police) and the subsequent benefits that this confers.

Adoption of the highway infrastructure will allow statutory traffic management to be undertaken by North Yorkshire Police and North Yorkshire County Council should the need arise.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

- Hambleton District Council retains ownership of Ellerbeck Court constructed under phases 2B and 3 Stokesley Business Park highway infrastructure.

The District Council will retain responsibility for the highway infrastructure; it will have an on-going financial liability for the maintenance on a revenue and capital basis in the short, medium and long term. As the infrastructure naturally deteriorates the capital expenditure proposed under this scheme and on a repeating cyclical basis will have to be expended at some stage to maintain the highway in safe condition.

The District Council will continue to owe a duty to highway users to maintain the surface in a safe condition and to manage the traffic issues; if we fail to maintain the surface in safe condition then we will become liable for any accidents that occur through negligence.

- Highway infrastructure brought up to adoptable standard by Hambleton District Council.
 - In-house management of works. The Design and Maintenance section has achieved adoption of highway infrastructure in the recent past. Current officer resource levels in the section combined with the wide portfolio of work the section currently undertakes, allied with the nature of the adoption process and the requirement for intense officer involvement during the adoption process mean that the work is not best suited to be undertaken by the Design and Maintenance Section at this time.
 - Management by a specialist adoption company. The proposal is to use JLES a company specialising in infrastructure adoption. They a track record of delivery and are experienced in achieving infrastructure adoption, successfully managing the adoption of highway infrastructure at Leeming Bar Business Park for the District Council. They are able to provide the dedicated intense staff resource involvement at the times that it is needed and have good relations with the adopting authorities. The risk controlled contract agreement between the District Council and JLES will ensure that payment is linked to the achievement of agreed milestone adoption outcomes. The Design and Maintenance section will manage JLES.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

Risk	Implication	Prob*	Imp*	Total	Preventative action
Deterioration of the highway infrastructure into unsafe or non-functioning condition due to inappropriate level of revenue and capital expenditure.	Asset condition will deteriorate and claims may ensue from users coupled with associated reputation consequences	5	3	15	Allocate appropriate level of revenue and capital expenditure to maintain asset condition. This will be required on a repeating cyclical basis whilst HDC retains ownership of the infrastructure.

Prob = Probability, Imp = Impact, Score range is Low = 1, High = 5

- The condition of the Phase 2B and 3 Stokesley Business Park highway infrastructure will naturally deteriorate with age; this will require an increasing level of revenue expenditure to maintain it in operationally functioning condition and in safe condition for users in the short and medium term. In the long term (5 to 10 years and every 20 years thereafter on average) and on the repeating cyclical basis, capital expenditure over and above the

proposed capital allocation sought under this scheme will be required to maintain the highway infrastructure.

- If an appropriate level of revenue and capital expenditure is not made available the highway infrastructure will deteriorate to a condition where it will become unsafe, the District Council as owner owes a duty of care to users and may be liable for injury or loss.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- **CO² Emissions**
Emissions related to the infrastructure will not fall under Hambleton; there may be emission reduction due to efficiency gains from management by the appropriate organisation.
- **Whole Life Costing**
Capital expenditure during 2012/13 will remove liability for future maintenance and capital expenditure on the highway infrastructure.
- **Social Effects**
Management of infrastructure by appropriate organisations including traffic management.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

- The Stokesley Business Park was constructed by Hambleton District Council to provide industrial development land. The sewerage infrastructure was adopted in October 2011 under a change in legislation. The highway infrastructure includes roads, footpaths and lighting.
- Adoption of highway infrastructure by North Yorkshire County Council – The Highway Authority will support the District Council strategic intent when entering into adoption agreements.

CONCLUSIONS:

The proposal to bring the sections of Ellerbeck Court constructed under phases 2B and 3 of Stokesley Business Park highway infrastructure up to a standard to enable adoption by North Yorkshire County Council represents good value for money.

The allocation of £49,000 of capital expenditure will achieve transfer of the highway infrastructure removing all associated District Council liabilities.

If the District Council do not approve the scheme and so retain ownership of the highway infrastructure in perpetuity then the natural deterioration of the highway infrastructure will eventually require cumulative maintenance and capital allocations in excess of the amount of capital expenditure proposed under this scheme.

Version Number : 2

Date last changed : 13 February 2012

**Lead Officer :
C Thornton / C Vincent**

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Hambleton Civic Centre Gas Boilers Replacement**Evidence of Need**

This is a statement regarding the necessary works in replacing the gas boilers at the Hambleton Civic Centre at Northallerton. The works represent value for money.

The Civic Centre was constructed over 25 years ago and the original gas boilers, providing the heating, are in need of replacement due to age and condition. One of the two boilers is now isolated and out of commission due to failure of the burners and excessive emissions of carbon monoxide. Certain parts are now obsolete and thus new replacements cannot be installed and the general condition is beyond viable economic repair.

Budget estimates of £42,000 have been obtained for replacing the boilers and associated flue system together with statutory amendments now required to the boiler room air circulation system. At present there is an allocation of £50,000 within the 10 year capital programme for this scheme.

COSTS:

Capital	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15
	£	£	£	£
Replacement gas boilers		40,000	-	-
Associated amendments to boiler room pipe work, flue & air circulation systems		2,000		
Total		<hr/> 42,000		
Financed by :				
Capital Programme		42,000	-	-
		<hr/> 42,000	<hr/> -	<hr/> -

The capital funding for this proposal is within a larger scheme allocation for Energy Saving Schemes for which £670k is identified in the 10 year programme.

Efficiency Gains

Modern efficient gas boilers would save approximately 8% on energy revenue running costs estimated at £1,000 per annum.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

The transitional and permanent works in replacing the two gas boilers will present no significant effect on customers and staff as each boiler can be isolated to ensure a heat source is always available.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

The feasibility of installing a biomass fuelled boiler system has been investigated which burn wood chips / pellets. Biomass boilers are 50% larger than gas boiler units and the available space in the upper plant room is not adequate. Although there may be carbon emission reductions the need to provide storage for the wood pellets plus the additional fuel costs significantly impacts on the viability and efficiency of this option.

Thus industry standard gas boiler replacement is deemed to be the most cost efficient and practicable option in achieving the required specification guarantees.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

- If the remaining duty boiler failed there would be no immediate ability to provide central heating for the Civic Centre until a temporary boiler was sited in the car park and connected to the system. In such an event during a cold winter snap there may be need for a temporary closure of the Civic Centre. This would result in the services the authority provides being affected.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- **CO² Emissions**
A replacement gas boiler system will be more efficient than the existing system in reducing energy costs and commensurate carbon emissions by some 8%.
- **Whole Life Costing**
The new gas boilers will have an anticipated life span of over 20 years.
- **Social Effects**
In reiteration of previously mentioned risk, the failure of the existing system may have consequential losses in corporate reputation in the event of a potential requirement to temporarily close the Civic Centre. A replacement boiler system would provide a more responsive and efficient heating system.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

If the Civic Centre offices had to temporarily close or resort to electric heaters the services the authority provides for NYCC, Housing, Benefits and other partners would be affected together with other agencies who share the building.

CONCLUSIONS:

Recommendation is to approve replacement of the duty and standby gas boilers at the Civic Centre by installing more energy efficient gas boilers, thus removing the risk of the facility temporarily closing due to lack of a central heating system.

The gas boiler replacements and associated works will cost an estimated £42,000.

This scheme is a component part of the approved energy savings scheme for which £670k is allocated in the 10 year programme.

Version Number : 2 Date last changed : 13 February 2012 Lead Officer : S Prentice / C Vincent
--

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Hambleton District Council Public Lighting Replacements

Evidence of Need

This scheme offers value for money in decreasing potential maintenance works and litigation costs in improving dangerous, deteriorating, damaged and inefficient public lighting stock which could be structurally unsound. In effecting these replacements reduces risks of the need to increase revenue.

The budget also covers the replacement of units where the means of support for the lamp has been removed by other parties such as utility poles, buildings or accident knock-downs.

The prioritisation and replacement of concrete columns for steel columns is also undertaken under this regime dependent on the condition of these obsolete columns. At present the Council maintains some 290 concrete columns which constitute 7.5% of its lamp support stock. The unit cost for replacing a concrete column with a steel replacement is approximately £1,000.

The Council have over four hundred 80 watt Mercury Based Filament Unit (MBFU) lamps which constitutes some 11% of lamp stock. A European initiative is anticipated in the near future, but not imminently, which would seek to cease the manufacture and supply of MBFU. The general unit cost for replacing an MBFU unit with a more efficient 42 watt PLT unit with compatible lantern housing is in the order of £200.

COSTS:**Capital**

	2011/12 £	2012/13 £	2013/14 £	2014/15 £
Public Lighting Replacements	36,000	36,000	36,000	36,000

Financed by :

Capital Programme	36,000	36,000	36,000	36,000
	<u>36,000</u>	<u>36,000</u>	<u>36,000</u>	<u>36,000</u>

Efficiency Gains

The efficiencies are gained via a reduced requirement in the short-term and routine maintenance requirements for the areas of replacement. Typically older lighting units run on higher wattage lamps and less energy efficient systems. Improvements invariably result in commensurate reductions in energy consumption and thus reduce electricity bills.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

The project will deliver for the Council and customers an improved lighting stock which will in-turn reduce maintenance costs and invariably associated energy running costs. This is manifested by the programme of prioritised replacements of obsolete concrete columns in conjunction with targeting combined replacements of more energy efficient lamps.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

The option in not undertaking a replacement programme would result in the current lighting stock falling into further state of ill-repair that may cause serious and significant danger to the public and lighting operatives under contract to replace faulty lamp units.

Alternative options with regard to potential transfer of the public lighting system to other bodies such as the County or Town / Parish Council falls outside the scope of this report. However, in the event of such potential options being pursued the quality and specification of the system being offered for adoption is likely to have a significant bearing on the adoption negotiations.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

Project delays or suspension would mean that the proportion of deteriorating stock would increase and the financial consequences increase the eventual overall replacement costs. The current lighting stock will fall into a state of ill-repair that may cause serious and significant danger to the public and lighting operatives under contract to replace faulty lamps and equipment.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- **CO² Emissions**

The replacement budgets is primarily prioritised at maintaining the deteriorating support equipment for lamp units however given that the older stock generally supports less energy efficient lamps there is an inherent association improving the energy efficiency as a consequence.

- **Whole Life Costing**

The general life expectancy for new steel columns and pole brackets with a six year cycle of painting is considered to be in the order of 20 to 30 years.

- **Social Effects**

Hambleton District Council public lighting system illuminates areas ranging from main / minor roads without footways; main / minor roads with footpaths; open footways; housing estates; village green; market places; footpath-cycleways; covered alleyways; high fenced/enclosed footpaths; public car parks; civic/leisure centre car parks; business/ industrial estate car parks and industrial park roads. With this range of lighting provision coupled with, in certain areas the CCTV system, public lighting provides a safe environment and a sense of security to the public. The replacement budget helps to ensure that prioritised older and deteriorating stock of support and lantern equipment is upgraded to continue to provide this service to the public.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

In the majority of towns and villages through the district street or roadway lighting is provided by both North Yorkshire County Council and Hambleton District Council. Recently NYCC have announced intentions to endeavour reducing their roadway maintenance and energy budgets over the forthcoming four years by some 20%. Amongst the range of measures likely to be adopted in achieving this target includes, the use of more energy saving lamps; part-nighting (automatic turn-off during the small hours); dimming (cutting down the lighting levels during the small hour) trimming (minor adjustment to the dusk and dawn light switching sensitivity levels) and in some cases decommissioning. In the event of the District Council adopting similar policies the continuance of the replacement programme would enhance the Councils preparedness and ease in effecting similar energy saving initiatives on a more up dated system.

CONCLUSIONS:

The regime of replacing old lighting stock reinforces the value for money in decreasing potential maintenance works and litigation costs in improving old stock which could be structurally unsound.

Version Number : 5

Date last changed : 22 February 2012

**Lead Officer :
C Vincent**

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

***Installation of Voltage Optimisers
Bedale & Stokesley Leisure Centres –***

Evidence of Need

1. The installation of Voltage Optimisers to the Bedale and Stokesley Leisure Centres represents value for money. It is one of the actions needed to reduce our Carbon usage as per the Carbon Management Programme (25% by 2014) contributing a predicted savings of 18 tonnes CO₂ savings ie 1.5% to our 1,106 tonnes total reductions target.
2. It will also achieve the combined revenue savings of £4,500 per annum at current electricity prices. The initial capital outlay of £24,000 will be recouped in 5.3 years, due to the revenue savings from the Energy budget.
3. In addition these units have a life expectancy of 20 years with no maintenance costs.
4. The project represents value for money.

COSTS:

Capital	20012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£	£	£	£
Voltage Optimiser Bedale	12,000	-	-	-
Voltage Optimiser Stokesley	12,000			
Financed by:				
Capital Programme:	24,000	-	-	-
	24,000	-	-	-

The capital funding for this proposal is within a larger scheme allocation for Energy Saving Schemes for which £670k is identified in the 10 year programme.

Revenue	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£	£	£	£
Electricity Energy Savings		4,500	4,500	4,500
Savings		4,500	4,500	4,500

Efficiency Gains

This technology will save 5% to 7% of the sites electrical usage, saving £4,500 per year, based on the present energy cost (tariff). Energy costs have been increasing so the saving will potentially be higher as the unit cost rises.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

The permanent works will present no significant changes to operational undertakings but will enhance life spans of electrical equipment. Revenue savings, as identified under the Finance section, will be achieved from the electricity energy budget with associated carbon emission reductions. There will be a short interruption of electrical supply for approximately 3 hours. The electrical disruption will occur outside the normal operating hours.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

This device is an industry recognised primary first phase method of reducing electric energy usage at source and approved by the Carbon Trust.

This work is being done in conjunction with many other initiatives in achieving target energy and carbon emission reductions

RISK ASSESSMENT:

No significant considered risks are associated with this project.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- | | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| CO₂ Emissions | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 5% - 7% reduction to the Bedale & Stokesley Leisure Centres. |
| Whole Life Costing | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Capital investment with no revenue running costs for 20 years |
| Social Effects | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Shows the Authority is managing its carbon footprint, encouraging others to follow our lead role |

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

There are no significant impacts relating to this scheme in relation to partnerships.

CONCLUSIONS:

The installation of voltage optimisers at the Bedale and Stokesley Leisure Centres at a cost of £24,000 be carried out for the benefit of meeting our Carbon Management Programme targets and the resulting revenue cost reductions of £4,500 per annum. Its 5.3 year payback with no associated revenue running costs and a 20 years lifespan make this a sound investment for long term energy and hence revenue cost savings.

This scheme is a component part of the approved energy savings scheme for which £670k is allocated in the 10 year programme.

Version Number: 5 Date last changed: 13 Feb 2012 Sponsor: Chris Vincent
--

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Additional Parking at Springboard Board Business Centre, Stokesley

Evidence of Need

This is a statement regarding the provision of additional parking at the Springboard Business Centre at Stokesley Business Park to meet the current business needs of the facility.

Springboard Business Centre was opened in 2005, the parking provided was 35 standard parking bays and one disabled bay; this met planning requirements at the time. The Business Centre has 20 units run by two site-based management staff.

The present level of parking provision is frequently unable to accommodate the tenants and their visitors, with average displacement of around 8 vehicles. This is causing difficulties for HDC staff trying to manage car parking and has been cited by a tenant as a reason for leaving the Centre.

Springboard also hosts business invitational events, these provide an important opportunity to maximise income; these events have been cut back as occupancy of the centre has increased so parking is not available to event attendees. Vehicles unable to park within the designated areas are displaced to grassed areas and the police have alleged the public highway has been obstructed.

The Springboard site has been assessed and there is sufficient space within the existing footprint to provide an additional 12 parking bays, subject to planning consent. The estimated cost if the construction matches the existing car park surfacing is £20,000, the capital expenditure to be allocated from the Service Improvement Reserve.

Hosted invitational event parking is to be provided on an as required based on a local agreement with the owner of an adjacent business development. The cost of the use of this facility will be incorporated into the hosted event costs.

COSTS:**Capital**

	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15
	£	£	£	£
Construction of additional 12 parking bays	-	20,000	-	-
<hr/>				
Financed by :				
Capital Programme	-	20,000	-	-
Total Capital Costs	-	20,000	-	-
<hr/>				

The scheme is currently not included within the approved 10 year Programme. The works would therefore need to be funded from savings within the overall allocation.

Efficiency Gains

There will be sufficient parking on-site for Springboard tenants and HDC staff, parking will not be a barrier to marketing vacant units so maximising rental income, staff will also be able to maximise income from hosted invitational events and they will not be involved in day-to-day management of parking issues.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

There will be enhanced tenant and visitor experience. The additional parking provision will mean that there will be sufficient on-site parking for tenants and their visitors and HDC staff which is not presently provided at the Centre. Tenants will not feel that they have to park in potentially inappropriate locations. Visitors to hosted invitational events will have a designated conveniently located off-site parking area which will not impact on tenant parking; costs of event parking will be included with the event fee.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

- Tenant Parking on adjacent premises – This is available, though would involve an on-going revenue commitment with no return, parking would not of been attractive for tenants and there is a risk that it may not always be available.
- Different construction techniques for the additional parking surfacing were considered to reduce costs; the matching of the existing surface provides the most sustainable long term benefits in terms of maintenance and marketing to prospective tenants.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

In not providing sufficient on-site parking Springboard becomes less attractive to prospective tenants, with the risk that the Centre will not achieve full occupancy and it fails to meet its rental income targets. Additional income opportunities from hosted invitational events will be reduced; these events also provide an opportunity to market the Centre to the potential tenants.

There is a reputational risk to the District Council if inappropriate parking is associated with a District Council facility.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

Additional parking on-site constructed to match the existing surfacing will provide a long term sustainable resolution to the present inadequate parking provision at the Centre for tenants, visitors and staff.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

The present parking difficulties has resulted in unnecessary interaction with North Yorkshire Police when alleged inappropriate parking is reported to them and with neighbouring businesses at the Stokesley Business Park Forum with consequential reputational issues for the Council.

CONCLUSIONS:

The proposal to extend the Springboard Business Centre car park represents good value for money. By approving £20,000 to provide additional on-site parking so that there is sufficient parking to meet the needs of tenants, visitors and staff, there will be sustainable resolution of the parking problems at the Centre.

Version Number : 2

Date last changed : 9 February 2012

**Lead Officer :
C Thornton / C Vincent**

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Hambleton Leisure Centre Roof Repairs**Evidence of Need**

This is a statement regarding the necessary works in repairing the roof and valley gutters at Hambleton Leisure Centre.

Hambleton Leisure Centre was constructed 25 years ago and the roof panels and valley gutters are leaking. As a consequence water ingress from the roof is causing structural damage to the steel stanchions and sports hall timber floor.

Intermediary repairs costing some £1,600 have been undertaken however these have been unsuccessful in effecting a lasting repair and as a consequence there has been further water ingress causing damage.

The capital proposal represents good value for money.

COSTS:**Capital**

	2012/13 £	2013/14 £	2014/15 £	2015/16 £
Roof and cladding repair works	15,000	-	-	-
Financed by :				
Capital Programme	15,000	-	-	-
	<u>0</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>

£81,000 is allocated within the Council's 10 year programme to cover both roof repairs at the Hambleton and Stokesley Leisure Centres. Stokesley Leisure Centre repair works are underway with an anticipated out turn of less than £65k. It is therefore anticipated that the two schemes can be accommodated within the approved capital allocation.

Efficiency Gains

Revenue savings will ensue regarding intermediary repairs ceasing to be necessary. Approximately £1,600 has been spent to date in effecting unsuccessful temporary repairs. The proposed scheme will mitigate any further impact on the overall maintenance budgets.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

The permanent works will present no significant changes to leisure centre operational undertakings. There are anticipated to be no adverse effects on users of the leisure centre other than the occupation of part of the car park by contractor's vehicles and scaffolding.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

Industry standard repair methods are deemed to be the only reasonable operational options in achieving the required specification guarantees.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

In not undertaking the works there will be further deterioration from water ingress on the fabric of the building and also have safety implications, particularly if the electrical systems are compromised and the sports hall floor warps under the damp conditions.

Delays will also impact on the overall future costs of the repair scheme.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- **CO² Emissions**
At present there are no significant increased heat losses.
- **Whole Life Costing**
The repaired roofing areas will likely be sustainable for a further 15 years and provide necessary protection to the fabric of the building.
- **Social Effects**
Should the repairs not be undertaken or significantly delayed this could result in the facility facing potential limited use or even full closure for a period in the event of more extensive repairs being necessary.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

No impacts to partnerships are anticipated subject to works being undertaken promptly.

This is a shared facility with North Yorkshire County Council with Allertonshire Secondary School located close by. There would be implications on school timetables and other agencies who utilise the centre should more extensive repairs be needed in the event of extended delays.

CONCLUSIONS:

Given the present condition of the roof and valley area at Hambleton Leisure Centre recommendation is for repair works, costing approximately £15,000, to be approved.

This would provide a 15 year watertight guarantee to the treated areas and a likely lifespan of over 20 years. The scheme represents good value for money.

Version Number : 3

Date last changed : 13 February 2012

**Lead Officer :
S Prentice / C Vincent**

VALUE FOR MONEY STATEMENT

Pipework Insulation Works at Stokesley, Thirsk and Bedale Leisure Centres

Evidence of Need

This is a statement regarding the necessary works to insulate the plant room pipes and valves at Bedale, Thirsk and Stokesley Leisure Centres in preventing heat loss and thus effecting energy savings and reduced revenue running costs. The scheme represents good value for money.

The existing pipes and valves located in the plant rooms provide hot water from the boilers to heating systems throughout the facilities. The heat loss has been calculated and insulating the pipes will result in an energy saving payback period of some 1.4 years on capital expenditure.

COSTS:**Capital**

	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15
	£	£	£	£
Stokesley Leisure Centre	2,500			
Thirsk Swimming Pool	2,000	-	-	-
Bedale Leisure Centre	2,500			

Financed by :

Capital Programme	7,000	-	-	-
	7,000	-	-	-

The capital funding for this proposal is within a larger scheme allocation for Energy Saving Schemes for which £670k is identified in the 10 year programme.

Efficiency Gains

Revenue savings will ensue, as the energy reduction will achieve saving per annum of :

- Stokesley Leisure Centre. £1,600
- Thirsk Swimming Pool. £1,200
- Bedale Leisure Centre. £1,700

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER:

There are anticipated to be no adverse effects on users of the leisure centre.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

Industry standard methods are deemed to be the only reasonable operational option in achieving the required specification guarantees.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

In not undertaking the works the identified carbon and revenue savings will not be met.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

- **CO² Emissions**
At present there are the identified heat losses. Should the insulation material not be fitted the heat losses will continue.
- **Whole Life Costing**
The insulation will be effective for a period of over 25 years.
- **Social Effects**
Undertaking these works will reinforce the Council's reputation in commitment to effecting energy efficiencies in reducing carbon emissions and financial savings.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS:

No impact.

CONCLUSIONS:

In undertaking pipe and valves insulation works at Stokesley, Thirsk and Bedale Leisure Centres for an estimated cost of £7,000. This represents good value for money.

The proposal is a component part of the approved energy savings scheme for which £670k is allocated in the 10 year programme.

The works will result in significant energy savings with an anticipated payback period of less than 2 years based on predicted energy cost rates.

Version Number : 2

Date last changed : 9 February 2012

**Lead Officer :
S Prentice / C Vincent**

VALUE FOR MONEY

PURCHASE OF BINS AND BOXES FOR REFUSE AND RECYCLING

EVIDENCE OF NEED:

Currently, residents of domestic properties are provided with green 240 litre bins for garden waste, black 240 litre bins for refuse collections, a blue bag for paper and a blue box for recycling tins, plastic bottles and glass. Minimum stock levels have been identified and maintained at around 400 bins of both colours and 250 blue recycling boxes. However, due to the recent tendering exercise for the disposal of dry recycle and the potential for change in the method of collection/type of receptacle, stock quantities were allowed to fall below identified minimum levels.

Provision of bins and boxes best ensures that a maximum volume of material is sent for recycling, therefore maximising income from green waste and dry recycle. Use of these receptacles leads to a reduction in littering and fly tipping.

The Waste Manager procures bins and boxes from a list of suppliers with consideration to price, quality, delivery and after-sales service.

The budget estimate for maintaining stocks of bins and boxes is £36,000 per annum; however £20,000 has been spent already on a one off order early in the year, this was taken from the revenue budget, but should be recovered from the Capital programme. This leaves £16,000 in the budget to replenish stocks. This is consistent with the HDC ten year programme allocation. This will ensure that all new developments are serviced and that the ageing green and black bins are replaced when necessary.

COSTS:

Capital

	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15
	£	£	£	£
Domestic bins, boxes, litter and dog bins	36,000 *	36,000	36,000	36,000

Financed by:

Capital Programme	36,000	36,000	36,000	36,000
-------------------	--------	--------	--------	--------

*£20,000 to cover existing spend and £16,000 for new purchases.

It is proposed to spend the full allocation as the bins are manufactured and imported from abroad (Ireland or Germany) and when ordering a shipping container the shipping and transport costs are the same for half a container as for a full one, this makes the unit price lower for a higher quantity of bins that fills a container.

Efficiency Gains

Replenishment of stock maintains current service and best ensures that there is no increase in waste sent for disposal, maximising recycling.

EFFECTS ON THE CUSTOMER

Without maintaining stocks of bins and boxes, replacement bins cannot be provided where they have been lost or stolen and for new build properties.

OPTION APPRAISAL:

The best prices are negotiated with suppliers. Bins could be purchased through YPO, but the unit price is c£2 more per bin. At present the most cost effective option is to buy bins in conjunction with Richmondshire. There may be scope in future to work with neighbouring authorities and so benefit from larger discounts for bigger orders.

RISK ASSESSMENT:

Should approval not be given to replenish stocks of bins and boxes there is a significant risk of service failure. Control over volume and types of waste put out for collection would be limited with residents being forced to use black sacks for all waste needs.

It is probable that alternative receptacles put out by residents would not be compatible with the lifting equipment on Council vehicles and may not be of sufficient quality. This has serious Health and Safety implications. There would also be a significant risk of a drop in customer satisfaction.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS

Failure to provide adequate bins and boxes would lead to an increase in dry recycle and green waste sent to landfill with negative impact on recycling rates and increase in emissions from landfill sites.

IMPACT ON PARTNERSHIPS

No impacts to partnerships are anticipated.

CONCLUSIONS:

Given the need to fulfil customer demand, environmental, financial and sustainability factors, the recommendation is to approve the purchase and to maintain existing performance/service requirements.

Version Number: 2.1

Date last changed: 28 Feb 2012

Sponsor: Mick Jewitt